

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

-----X  
GEORGE W. BROWN,

Plaintiff,

-against-

THE BROOKDALE HOSPITAL MEDICAL CENTER,  
SANJEEV RAJPAL, M.D., CLASS SURGERY  
BROOKLYN GROUP, P.C., THE MOUNT SINAI  
HOSPITAL, HOWARD CHOI, M.D., DANIELLE  
PERRET, M.D., BRIAN RIORDAN, M.D., NEW  
FRANKLIN REHABILITATION & HEALTH CARE  
FACILITY, LLC, FRANKLIN CENTER FOR  
REHABILITATION & NURSING, INC., FRANKLIN  
CENTER FOR REHABILITATION & NURSING,  
ISRAEL SHERMAN, WILLIAM DUKE, M.D.,  
HILLSIDE MANOR COMPREHENSIVE CARE  
CENTER, and THE NEW YORK HOSPITAL  
MEDICAL CENTER OF QUEENS,

Defendants.  
-----X

Case No.: 08 CV 1093

**ANSWER**

**J. McKenna**

The Defendant, HILLSIDE MANOR COMPREHENSIVE CARE CENTER  
("Defendant"), by their attorneys, FUREY, FUREY, LEVERAGE, MANZIONE, WILLIAMS &  
DARLINGTON, P.C., answering the Complaint and Jury Demand of the plaintiff herein, upon  
information and belief:

**AS AND FOR AN ANSWER TO NATURE OF THE CASE**

**FIRST:** Defendant denies each and every allegation contained in paragraph "1" of  
the Complaint, and refers all questions of law to the Court.

**SECOND:** Defendant denies each and every allegation contained in paragraphs "2", "3"  
and "4" of the Complaint and further denies knowledge or information thereof sufficient to form a  
belief as to all of the above-named co-defendants.

**THIRD:** Defendant denies knowledge or information thereof sufficient to form a belief as to each and every allegation contained in paragraphs “5”, “6”, “7” and “8” of the Complaint.

**AS AND FOR AN ANSWER TO JURISDICTION AND  
VENUE AND PARTIES**

**FOURTH:** Defendant denies knowledge or information thereof sufficient to form a belief as to each and every allegation contained in paragraphs “9” and “10” of the Complaint.

**Plaintiff**

**FIFTH:** Defendant denies knowledge or information thereof sufficient to form a belief as to each and every allegation contained in paragraph “11” of the Complaint.

**The Nursing Home Defendants**

**SIXTH:** Defendant denies knowledge or information thereof sufficient to form a belief as to each and every allegation contained in paragraphs “12”, “13”, “14”, “15”, “16”, “17”, “18”, “19”, “20”, “21”, “22”, “23”, “24”, “25”, “26”, “27”, “28”, “29”, “30”, “31”, “32”, “33”, “34”, “35”, “36”, “37”, “38” and “39” of the Complaint.

**SEVENTH:** Defendant denies each and every allegation contained in paragraphs “40”, “41”, “42”, “43”, “44”, “45” and “46” of the Complaint.

**Sanjev Rajpal, M.D. and Class Surgery Brooklyn Group, P.C.**

**EIGHT:** Defendant denies knowledge or information thereof sufficient to form a belief as to each and every allegation contained in paragraphs “47”, “48”, “49”, “50”, “51”, “52”, “53”, “54”, “55” and “56” of the Complaint.

**The Brookdale Hospital Medical Center**

**NINTH:** Defendant denies any knowledge or information thereof sufficient to form a belief as to each and every allegation contained in paragraphs “57”, “58”, “59”, “60” and “61” of the Complaint.

**The Mount Sinai Hospital, Howard Choi, M.D., Danille Perret, M.D., and Brian Riordan, M.D.**

**TENTH:** Defendant denies knowledge or information thereof sufficient to form a belief as to each and every allegation contained in paragraphs “62”, “63”, “64”, “65”, “66”, “67”, “68”, “69”, “70”, “71”, “72” and “73” of the Complaint.

**The New York Hospital Medical Center of Queens**

**ELEVENTH:** Defendant denies knowledge or information thereof sufficient to form a belief as to each and every allegation contained in paragraphs “74”, “75”, “76” and “77” of the Complaint.

**AS AND FOR AN ANSWER TO GENERAL FACTUAL  
BACKGROUND**

**TWELFTH:** Defendant denies any knowledge or information thereof sufficient to form a belief as to each and every allegation contained in paragraphs “78”, “79”, “80” and “81” of the Complaint.

**AS AN FOR AN ANSWER TO THE FIRST CAUSE OF  
ACTION AS TO: NEW FRANKLIN REHABILITATION &  
HEALTH CARE FACILITY, LLC, FRANKLIN CENTER  
FOR REHABILITATION & NURSING, INC., FRANKLIN  
CENTER FOR REHABILITATION & NURSING, ISRAEL  
SHERMAN and WILLIAM DUKE, M.D.**

**THIRTEENTH:** In answer to paragraph “82” of the Complaint, Defendant hereby repeats, reiterates and realleges each and every admission and denial set forth in answer to

paragraphs marked “1” through “81” of the Complaint, inclusive with the same force and effect as if same were set forth herein at length.

**FORTEENTH:** Defendant denies knowledge or information thereof sufficient to form a belief as to each and every allegation contained in paragraphs “83”, “84”, “85”, “86”, “87”, “88”, “89”, “90”, “91”, “92”, “93”, “94”, “95”, “96” and “97” of the Complaint.

**AS AND FOR AN ANSWER TO THE SECOND CAUSE OF ACTION AS TO: NEW FRANKLIN REHABILITATION & HEALTH CARE FACILITY, LLC, FRANKLIN CENTER FOR REHABILITATION & NURSING, INC., FRANKLIN CENTER FOR REHABILITATION & NURSING, ISRAEL SHERMAN and WILLIAM DUKE, M.D. PURSUANT TO 42 U.S.C. § 1395i-3; 42 U.S.C. § 1396r and 42 CFR Part 483. et seq.**

**FIFTEENTH:** In answer to paragraph “98” of the Complaint, Defendant hereby repeats, reiterates and realleges each and every admission and denial set forth in answer to paragraphs marked “1” through “97” of the Complaint, inclusive with the same force and effect as if same were set forth herein at length.

**SIXTEENTH:** Defendant denies knowledge or information thereof sufficient to form a belief as to each and every allegation contained in paragraphs “99”, “100”, “101”, “102”, “103”, “104”, “105”, “106” and “107” of the Complaint.

**SEVENTEENTH:** Defendant denies each and every allegation contained in paragraph “108” of the Complaint.

**AS AND FOR AN ANSWER TO THE THIRD CAUSE OF ACTION AS TO: NEW FRANKLIN REHABILITATION & HEALTH CARE FACILITY, LLC, FRANKLIN CENTER FOR REHABILITATION & NURSING, INC., FRANKLIN CENTER FOR REHABILITATION & NURSING, ISRAEL SHERMAN and WILLIAM DUKE, M.D., UNDER NEW YORK PUBLIC HEALTH LAW § 2801-d and 10 NYCRR § 415.12**

---

**EIGHTEENTH:** In answer to paragraph "109" of the Complaint, Defendant hereby repeats, reiterates and realleges each and every admission and denial set forth in answer to paragraphs marked "1" through "108" of the Complaint, inclusive with the same force and effect as if same were set forth herein at length.

**NINETEENTH:** Defendant denies knowledge or information thereof sufficient to form a belief as to each and every allegation contained in paragraphs "110", "111", "112", "114", "115", "116", "118" and "119" of the Complaint herein.

**TWENTIETH:** Defendant denies each and every allegation, in the form alleged, contained in paragraphs "113" and "117" of the Complaint and refers all questions of law to the Court.

**AS AND FOR AN ANSWER TO THE FOURTH CAUSE OF ACTION AS TO: THE BROOKDALE HOSPITAL MEDICAL CENTER and SANJEEV RAJPAL, M.D.**

---

**TWENTY-FIRST:** In answer to paragraph "120" of the Complaint, Defendant hereby repeats, reiterates and realleges each and every admission and denial set forth in answer to paragraphs marked "1" through "119" of the Complaint, inclusive with the same force and effect as if same were set forth herein at length.

**TWENTY-SECOND:** Defendant denies knowledge or information thereof sufficient to form a belief as to each and every allegation contained in paragraphs "121", "122", "123", "124", "125", "126", "127", "128" and "129" of the Complaint.

**TWENTY-THIRD:** Defendant denies each and every allegation contained in paragraph “130” of the Complaint and refers all questions of law to the Court.

**AS AND FOR AN ANSWER TO THE FIFTH CAUSE OF  
ACTION AS TO: SANJEEV RAJPAL, M.D. AND CLASS  
SURGERY BROOKLYN GROUP, P.C.**

---

**TWENTY-FOURTH:** In answer to paragraph “131” of the Complaint, Defendant hereby repeats, reiterates and realleges each and every admission and denial set forth in answer to paragraphs marked “1” through “130” of the Complaint, inclusive with the same force and effect as if same were set forth herein at length.

**TWENTY-FIFTH:** Defendant denies knowledge or information thereof sufficient to form a belief as to each and every allegation contained in paragraphs “132”, “133”, “134”, “135”, “136”, “137”, “138”, “139”, “140” and “141” of the Complaint.

**TWENTY-SIXTH:** Defendant denies each and every allegation contained in paragraph “142” of the Complaint and refers all questions of law to the Court.

**AS AND FOR AN ANSWER TO THE SIXTH CAUSE OF  
ACTION AS TO: THE MOUNT SINAI HOSPITAL,  
HOWARD CHOI, M.D., DANIELLE PERRET, M.D. and  
BRIAN RIORDAN, M.D.**

---

**TWENTY-SEVENTH:** In answer to paragraph “143” of the Complaint, Defendant hereby repeats, reiterates and realleges each and every admission and denial set forth in answer to paragraphs marked “1” through “142” of the Complaint, inclusive with the same force and effect as if same were set forth herein at length.

**TWENTY-EIGHTH:** Defendant denies knowledge or information thereof sufficient to form a belief as to each and every allegation contained in paragraphs “144”, “145”, “146”, “147”, “148”, “149”, “150” and “151” of the Complaint.



**TWENTY-NINTH:** Defendant denies each and every allegation contained in paragraph “152” of the Complaint.

**THIRTIETH:** Defendant denies each and every allegation contained in paragraph “153” of the Complaint herein and refers all questions of law to the Court.

**AS AND FOR AN ANSWER TO THE SEVENTH CAUSE OF  
ACTION AS TO: WILLIAM DUKE, M.D. and HILLSIDE  
MANOR COMPREHENSIVE CARE CENTER**

**THIRTY-FIRST:** In answer to paragraph “154” of the Complaint, Defendant hereby repeats, reiterates and realleges each and every admission and denial set forth in answer to paragraphs marked “1” through “153” of the Complaint, inclusive with the same force and effect as if same were set forth herein at length.

**THIRTY-SECOND:** Defendant denies knowledge or information thereof sufficient to form a belief as to each and every allegation contained in paragraph “155” of the Complaint herein.

**THIRTY-THIRD:** Defendant denies each and every allegation contained in paragraph “156” of the Complaint herein.

**THIRTY-FOURTH:** Defendant denies each and every allegation contained in paragraphs “157”, “158”, “159”, “160”, “161”, “162”, “163” and “164”, and further denies any knowledge or information thereof sufficient to form a belief as to each and every allegation as to co-defendant WILLIAM DUKE, M.D. in the Complaint.

**THIRTY-FIFTH:** Defendant denies each and every allegation, in the form alleged, contained in paragraph “165” of the Complaint and refers all questions of law to the Court.

**AS AND FOR AN ANSWER TO THE EIGHTH CAUSE OF  
ACTION AS TO: THE NEW YORK HOSPITAL MEDICAL  
CENTER OF QUEENS and WILLIAM DUKE, M.D.**

**THIRTY-SIXTH:** In answer to paragraph "166" of the Complaint, Defendant hereby repeats, reiterates and realleges each and every admission and denial set forth in answer to paragraphs marked "1" through "165" of the Complaint, inclusive with the same force and effect as if same were set forth herein at length.

**THIRTY-SEVENTH:** Defendant denies any knowledge or information thereof sufficient to form a belief as to each and every allegation contained in paragraphs "167", "168", "169", "170", "171", "172", "173", "174" and "175" in the Complaint herein.

**THIRTY-EIGHTH:** Defendant denies each and every allegation contained in paragraph "176" of the Complaint.

**THIRTY-NINTH:** Defendant denies each and every allegation contained in paragraph "177" of the Complaint herein and refers all questions of law to the Court.

**AS AND FOR AN ANSWER TO DAMAGES**

**FORTIETH:** Defendant denies each and every allegation contained in paragraph "178" of the Complaint herein.

**FORTY-FIRST:** Defendant demands that liability, if any, be apportioned.

**AS AND FOR A FIRST, SEPARATE AND COMPLETE  
AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

**FORTY-SECOND:** Upon information and belief, the medical malpractice claims asserted by the plaintiff are barred in whole or in part by the applicable statute of limitations.

**AS AND FOR A SECOND, SEPARATE AND COMPLETE  
AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**



**FORTY-THIRD:** Upon information and belief, the injuries and/or damages allegedly sustained by the plaintiff were caused in whole or in part by the plaintiff's own culpable conduct and/or assumption of risk.

**AS AND FOR A THIRD, SEPARATE AND COMPLETE  
AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

**FORTY-FOURTH:** Upon information and belief, the plaintiff has not effectuated valid service and therefore, this Court lacks jurisdiction over this Defendant.

**AS AND FOR A FOURTH, SEPARATE AND COMPLETE  
AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

**FORTY-FIFTH:** Upon information and belief, Defendant exercised all care reasonably necessary to prevent and limit the deprivation and injury for which liability is alleged by plaintiff.

**AS AND FOR A FIFTH, SEPARATE AND COMPLETE  
AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

**FORTY-SIXTH:** Upon information and belief, Defendant's facility ceased operations before the dates of the alleged malpractice and statutory violations.

**AS AND FOR A SIXTH, SEPARATE AND COMPLETE  
AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

**FORTY-SEVENTH:** Upon information and belief, any damages sustained by the plaintiff was caused in whole or in part by the culpable conduct of the plaintiff, and/or plaintiff's damages were aggravated by his own culpable conduct.

**AS AND FOR A SEVENTH, SEPARATE AND COMPLETE  
AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

**FORTY-EIGHTH:** Defendant will rely upon the provisions of Article 16 of the CPLR with regard to the limitation of joint and several liability.

**WHEREFORE**, Defendant, HILLSIDE MANOR COMPREHENSIVE CARE CENTER, demands judgment dismissing the Complaint, together with interest, costs, disbursements or judgment over, as may be required by law.

Dated: Hempstead, New York  
February 27, 2008

Yours, etc.,

FUREY, FUREY, LEVERAGE, MANZIONE,  
WILLIAMS & DARLINGTON, P.C.

By:   
WILLIAM T. COLLINS, III (WTC 2249)

**Attorneys for Defendant**  
HILLSIDE MANOR  
COMPREHENSIVE CARE CENTER  
Office Address:  
600 Front Street  
Hempstead, New York 11550  
(516) 538-2500

To:

LEAHEY & JOHNSON, P.C.  
Attn: Peter James Johnson, Jr. (PJJ 5589)  
**Attorneys for Plaintiff**  
120 Wall Street, Ste. 2220  
New York, New York 10005  
(212) 269-7308

THE BROOKDALE HOSPITAL MEDICAL CENTER  
**Defendant Pro Se**  
One Brookdale Plaza  
Brooklyn, New York 11212

SANJEEV RAJPAL, M.D.  
**Defendant Pro Se**  
1633 Remsen Avenue  
Brooklyn, New York 11236

CLASS SURGERY BROOKLYN GROUP, P.C.  
**Defendant Pro Se**  
1633 Remsen Avenue  
Brooklyn, New York 11236

NEW FRANKLIN REHABILITATION  
and HEALTH CARE FACILITY, LLC

**Defendant Pro Se**

147-27 Franklin Avenue  
Flushing, New York 11355

FRANKLIN CENTER FOR REHABILITATION  
& NURSING, INC.

**Defendant Pro Se**

147-27 Franklin Avenue  
Flushing, New York 11355

FRANKLIN CENTER FOR REHABILITATION  
& NURSING

**Defendant Pro Se**

147-27 Franklin Avenue  
Flushing, New York 11355

ISRAEL SHERMAN

**Defendant Pro Se**

7233 137<sup>th</sup> Street  
Flushing, New York 11367-2310  
THE NEW YORK HOSPITAL MEDICAL  
CENTER OF QUEENS

**Defendant Pro Se**

56-45 Main Street  
Flushing, New York 11355

WILLIAM DUKE, M.D.

**Defendant Pro Se**

118-11 Hillside Avenue  
Hollis, New York 11423

THE MOUNT SINAI HOSPITAL

**Defendant Pro Se**

One Gustave L. Levy Place  
New York, New York 10029

HOWARD CHOI, M.D.

**Defendant Pro Se**

One Gustave L. Levy Place  
New York, New York 10029

DANIELLE PERRET, M.D.

**Defendant Pro Se**

One Gustave L. Levy Place  
New York, New York 10029

BRIAN RIORDAN, M.D.

**Defendant Pro Se**

One Gustave L. Levy Place  
New York, New York 10029

**Certificate of Mailing**

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing **ANSWER** pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure §26 was mailed by First Class postage prepaid this 27<sup>th</sup> day of February, 2008, and was filed with the Clerk of the Court and served in accordance with the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, and/or the Southern District's Local Rules on Electronic Service, upon all counsel and parties of record as indicated on the Service List below:

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
WILLIAM T. COLLINS, III (WTC 2249)

**Service List**

To:

LEAHEY & JOHNSON, P.C.  
Attn: Peter James Johnson, Jr. (PJJ 5589)  
**Attorneys for Plaintiff**  
120 Wall Street, Ste. 2220  
New York, New York 10005  
(212) 269-7308

THE BROOKDALE HOSPITAL MEDICAL CENTER  
**Defendant Pro Se**  
One Brookdale Plaza  
Brooklyn, New York 11212

SANJEEV RAJPAL, M.D.  
**Defendant Pro Se**  
1633 Remsen Avenue  
Brooklyn, New York 11236

CLASS SURGERY BROOKLYN GROUP, P.C.  
**Defendant Pro Se**  
1633 Remsen Avenue  
Brooklyn, New York 11236

NEW FRANKLIN REHABILITATION  
and HEALTH CARE FACILITY, LLC  
**Defendant Pro Se**  
147-27 Franklin Avenue  
Flushing, New York 11355

FRANKLIN CENTER FOR REHABILITATION  
& NURSING, INC.

**Defendant Pro Se**

147-27 Franklin Avenue  
Flushing, New York 11355

FRANKLIN CENTER FOR REHABILITATION  
& NURSING

**Defendant Pro Se**

147-27 Franklin Avenue  
Flushing, New York 11355

ISRAEL SHERMAN

**Defendant Pro Se**

7233 137<sup>th</sup> Street  
Flushing, New York 11367-2310

THE NEW YORK HOSPITAL MEDICAL  
CENTER OF QUEENS

**Defendant Pro Se**

56-45 Main Street  
Flushing, New York 11355

WILLIAM DUKE, M.D.

**Defendant Pro Se**

118-11 Hillside Avenue  
Hollis, New York 11423

THE MOUNT SINAI HOSPITAL

**Defendant Pro Se**

One Gustave L. Levy Place  
New York, New York 10029

HOWARD CHOI, M.D.

**Defendant Pro Se**

One Gustave L. Levy Place  
New York, New York 10029

DANIELLE PERRET, M.D.

**Defendant Pro Se**

One Gustave L. Levy Place  
New York, New York 10029

BRIAN RIORDAN, M.D.

**Defendant Pro Se**

One Gustave L. Levy Place  
New York, New York 10029



Case No. 08 CV 1093 (Judge McKenna, U.S.D.J.)

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

---

GEORGE W. BROWN,

Plaintiff,

-against-

THE BROOKDALE HOSPITAL MEDICAL CENTER,  
SANJEEV RAJPAL, M.D., CLASS SURGERY  
BROOKLYN GROUP, P.C., THE MOUNT SINAI  
HOSPITAL, HOWARD CHOI, M.D., DANIELLE  
PERRET, M.D., BRIAN RIORDAN, M.D., NEW  
FRANKLIN REHABILITATION & HEALTH CARE  
FACILITY, LLC, FRANKLIN CENTER FOR  
REHABILITATION & NURSING, INC., FRANKLIN  
CENTER FOR REHABILITATION & NURSING,  
ISRAEL SHERMAN, WILLIAM DUKE, M.D.,  
HILLSIDE MANOR COMPREHENSIVE CARE  
CENTER, and THE NEW YORK HOSPITAL  
MEDICAL CENTER OF QUEENS,

Defendants.

---

ANSWER

---

**Furey, Furey, Leverage, Manzione, Williams & Darlington, P.C.**

**By William T. Collins, III, Esq. (WTC 2249)**

*Attorneys for Defendant*

**HILLSIDE MANOR COMPREHENSIVE CARE CENTER**

600 FRONT STREET

HEMPSTEAD, NEW YORK 11550

(516) 538-2500

Fax No. 516-489-5056